

**Review of Child Safeguarding Practice
in the religious congregation of**

The Carmelite Sisters for the Aged and Infirm

undertaken by

**The National Board for Safeguarding Children in the
Catholic Church in Ireland (NBSCCCI)**

Date: February 2016

CONTENTS	Page
Background	3
Introduction	4
Role Profile	4
Profile of Members	4
Policy and Procedures Document	5
Structures	5
Management of Allegations	5
Conclusion	6
Terms of Reference	7

Background

The National Board for Safeguarding Children in the Catholic Church in Ireland (NBSCCCI) was asked by the Sponsoring Bodies, namely the Episcopal Conference, the Conference of Religious of Ireland and the Irish Missionary Union, to undertake a comprehensive review of safeguarding practice within and across all the Church authorities on the island of Ireland. The purpose of the review is to confirm that current safeguarding practice complies with the Standards set down within the guidance issued by the Sponsoring Bodies in February 2009, and that all known allegations and concerns had been appropriately dealt with. To achieve this task, safeguarding practice in each Church authority is to be reviewed through an examination of case records and through interviews with key personnel involved both within and external to a Diocese or other authority.

This report contains the findings of the *Review of Safeguarding Practice in the religious congregation of the Carmelite Sisters for the Aged and Infirm* undertaken by the NBSCCCI in line with the request made to it by the Sponsoring Bodies. The findings of the review have been shared with a reference group before being submitted to the Prioress, Sr. Mary Healy O. Carm., along with any recommendations arising from the findings.

The review is not based on a review of case material as during the relevant time period there were no allegations made against members of the congregation that were within the Terms of Reference. There also were no allegations in respect of other forms of abuse within the time period, in respect of deceased and living members of the congregation. The review therefore is primarily based on policies and procedures made available plus interviews with key personnel involved in the safeguarding process within the Congregation, particularly in the services run by the Congregation.

Introduction

This congregation is largely based in the USA, and it has one house in Ireland, Our Lady's Manor, Dalkey, Co. Dublin. The congregation was in fact founded by an Irish woman, Bridget Teresa McCrory from Co. Tyrone. Bridget McCrory was born in January 1893, but when she was seven years of age, her family migrated to Scotland where she spent the remainder of her childhood. On reaching 19-years of age, Bridget left her home and travelled to La Tour in France to undertake her Novitiate with the Little Sisters of the Poor. Once she was professed as Sister Angeline, she was sent to the United States.

At age 33, the then Mother Angeline was appointed Superior of a Home of the Little Sisters of the Poor in the Bronx, New York, in 1926. The following year while on retreat, Angeline felt that she was being drawn to work with elderly people to a greater extent than her ministry with the Little Sisters allowed her to do.

With encouragement from Patrick Cardinal Hayes of New York to whom she turned for guidance, Mother Angeline and six other Sisters withdrew from the Little Sisters. On application to the Vatican they were granted permission to establish a new religious community of professed women who would care for elderly people. On September 3, 1929, the Carmelite Sisters for the Aged and Infirm was founded.

The following detail is provided on the congregation's website (www.carmelitesisters.com)

Thus, though the inspiration Mother received from the Congregation dedicated to the aged poor, she was now able to further develop this needed apostolate with new methods. From the very start, the Carmelite Friars in New York took a deep interest in Mother and her companions. In 1931 the new Community became affiliated with the great Order of Carmel and became known as "Carmelite Sisters for the Aged and Infirm."

Mother Angeline Teresa the Foundress of this congregation died on January 21, 1984. She is buried at St. Teresa's Motherhouse in Germantown, New York.

On June 28, 2012, His Holiness, Pope Benedict XVI decreed that she would be known as Venerable Mary Angeline Teresa, O. Carm., the first step towards canonisation.

The ministry of the Carmelite Sisters for the Aged and Infirm is to the elderly in long-term healthcare, assisted living and independent living facilities. They provide this ministry in 18 locations in the USA, and in Our Lady's Manor in Dalkey, Co Dublin in Ireland.

Role Profile (past and present role with children)

The Carmelite Sisters for the Aged and Infirm do not have any formal ministry with children in any of their communities. Children who are relatives of elderly people who live in the nursing home at Our Lady's Manor do visit their family members who are cared for there. The nursing home also offers practical experience to Transition Year students, male and female, from two second level schools in South Dublin. No child or young person is allowed access to the nursing home unless they are under the supervision of an adult guardian, in the case of visiting children, or of a staff member, in the case of a Transition Year student.

Profile of Members

There are five members of the congregation in the community house in Dalkey, four of whom are active. They range in age from 58 years of age to 73 years of age. All have completed their initial Formation in the USA.

Policy and Procedures Document

The congregation has a short Child Protection Policy which was authorized in October 2010 by the Sister who was the then Nursing Administrator. This has been reviewed in October 2012 and October 2014, and is due for further review in October 2016. The purpose of the policy is:

To ensure a consistent, appropriate and person-centered response in dealing with the safety and well-being of children visiting Our Lady's Manor.

The current Prioress of the congregation in Dalkey has not been in post for very long. She is anxious to update the Congregation's Child Protection Policy and to this end has been in discussions with another female religious order that is involved in nursing care for elderly people to learn from them how they handle Child Safeguarding matters. She has also engaged with the NBSCCCI in relation to advice and training opportunities.

Recommendation 1:

The Prioress must ensure that in the revision of the Policy and Procedures account of

- i. the involvement of second level students in the nursing home;**
- ii. the allocation of responsibilities to named members of staff; and**
- iii. the requirement to provide information on persons to contact in the event of anyone having a concern about the safety and welfare of a child or young person.**

The NBSCCCI will provide information, advice and guidance to the congregation on how to more comprehensively meet Child Safeguarding Standards.

The congregation does proactively display and provide posters and pamphlets to inform visitors about Child Safeguarding practice in Our Lady's Manor. All staff employed there are Garda vetted prior to their deployment. There is an integrated CCTV system installed throughout the premises. These three safeguarding initiatives are commended.

Structures

The Prioress is the only member of the congregation who has specific Child Safeguarding responsibilities.

Recommendation 2:

That the Prioress convenes a small Safeguarding Committee that would share the responsibility for ensuring that all children and young people who visit Our Lady's Manor are safe and protected, through more structured and consistent communication of the Child Safeguarding message.

Management of Allegations and liaison with the statutory authorities

There have been no concerns, suspicions or allegations related to the Carmelite Sister for the Aged and Infirm in Ireland. It has not therefore been necessary for the congregation to develop and maintain working relationships with An Garda Síochána and with Tusla – the Child and Family Agency.

Conclusion

This congregation does not have a direct ministry to children and young people. It is however aware and mindful of its responsibilities to children and young people who visit its community at Our Lady's Manor in Dalkey. Under the direction of a new Prioress it will continue to consolidate and develop its Child Safeguarding systems and practices.

Review of Safeguarding in the Catholic Church in Ireland

Terms of Reference (which should be read in conjunction with the accompanying Notes)

Small Religious Congregations

Introduction

In order for the National Board to be able to state that all Church Authorities on the island of Ireland have been evaluated in respect of their child safeguarding policies and practices, both historical and current, then some form of appropriate assessment has to be conducted of every one of these. It is rational however that the form of assessment is tailored to the profile of each Church Authority, and that needless expenditure of resources and unnecessary interference in the life of religious orders and communities that have no children-specific ministry would be avoided.

This Review seeks to examine the current arrangements for safeguarding children across small Religious Congregations /Orders, and Missionary Societies in Ireland who have limited or no direct contact with children as part of the Congregations ministry.

It would also scrutinize practice within all known cases to ensure that they have been responded to appropriately.

The review's methodology is an adaptation of the methodology developed for all Dioceses and large religious congregations and missionary societies, where the ministry involves regular contact with children.

The proposed Review would consider the following:-

- (a) Former role with children
- (b) Allegations of child abuse against members and how these have been responded to
- (c) Existing relationships with statutory authorities such as the HSE, Gardai in the Republic and the HSCT or PSNI in Northern Ireland.
- (d) Policies in place and being applied for safeguarding children
- (e) Roles and responsibilities and where they exist the operation of Advisory Panels, and Safeguarding Committees

The objective of the Review would be to confirm if there have been any allegations and how known allegations have been responded to; in addition the review seeks to confirm what the current arrangements for safeguarding children are. In particular, emphasis will be placed on establishing how policies and practice matches up to the standards set down in the Safeguarding Children Guidance published by the National Board for Safeguarding Children in the Catholic Church launched in February 2009. Priority, at all times, will be given to how policy and practice can be improved and strengthened. If policies and/or practices are identified that are concerning, inadequate, or dangerous, they will be addressed through the provision of guidance and support, and through the reporting of these situations to the appropriate statutory authorities, if this has not already happened. Similarly, those that are good examples will be highlighted with a view to them being adopted comprehensively across all parts of the Church. All cases that relate to alleged or known offenders that are alive will be read and included in the Review. In cases where the alleged or known offender

is deceased, these will be sampled in an attempt to gather learning from them that will be used to inform the framing of recommendations.

Guidance Documents

The Review will be guided by the following:-

- (a) Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance;
- (b) Children First Guidance in ROI; and Regional Child Protection Guidelines in Northern Ireland;
- (c) Legislation that exists in each jurisdiction which contributes to safeguarding children and young people.

The Review will be undertaken by the National Board for Safeguarding Children through their National Office and led by the Chief Executive Officer.

The Review process will be overseen by a **Reference Group** to whom the CEO will report on a regular basis. The membership of this **Reference Group** has been drawn from each of the statutory child protection agencies in both jurisdictions, along with eminent individuals in the field from academia. The current Reference Group consists of : Dr Helen Buckley (TCD); Mr Paul Harrison (Tusla), and John Toner (SBNI).

It is important to confirm that the value of the Review is dependent upon full and complete access to all relevant documentation and information relating to the abuse of children known to the individual Church authorities. The Review will proceed on the basis that willingness exists on the part of each of the subjects of the Review to provide full access to the fieldwork team, subject, where relevant, to the terms of the Data Processing Deed agreed between the Sponsoring Bodies and entered into between the parties hereto.

Step Guide to the Review Process

Step 1.

A letter of invitation to review is sent by the Provincial/Regional Superior or other person responsible for the Congregation/ Order or Missionary Society (hereinafter referred to as ‘the Ordinary’).

Step 2.

The CEO will forward a survey to the provincial which will identify:

- Current number of members
- Past role with children
- Current role with children
- Total number of allegations received up to 2014
- Number of living members against whom there are allegations

Step 3.

For any Order where there have been allegations a full review will proceed, as per step 4 - 23. For those Orders where there have been no known allegations a desk top examination of policies and procedures will take place followed by a site visit to interview all relevant personnel within the safeguarding structure. For these orders **step 5 and 13-23** will apply.

Step 4.

The CEO and Ordinary will confirm the dates for the fieldwork for the Review, and names of the fieldwork team.

Step 5.

The Church Authority will be asked to make available all of the case files and related documentation in respect of any safeguarding concerns that have been identified within the diocese. The Church Authority will make available a room with wireless internet access for the reviewers to conduct their review of files, so that any records made by the reviewers can be directly typed and stored onto a secure server which is only accessed by the reviewers. In the absence of internet access the reviewers will type their notes onto a secure encrypted usb stick for later uploading onto the secure server.

Step 6.

The Church Authority will be requested to sign the revised Data Processing Deed prior to the arrival of the team.

Step 7.

The Church Authority will arrange a schedule of interviews with all who hold safeguarding roles within its functional area. The designated person and the Church Authority will be available to the reviewers throughout the period of fieldwork.

Step 8.

The fieldwork team when they arrive on site will firstly confirm that they have a suitable place to work in and that all the required documentation has been provided to them for their Review. In the event that the fieldwork team forms the opinion that the Church Authority has not provided access to all such documents, the Board shall give notice in writing to the Church Authority of the opinion of the fieldwork team and such notice shall specify the reasons for same. Thereupon, the Church Authority shall respond in detail to the Notice. Each party shall use its best endeavours to resolve any differences of opinion which shall arise and, in the event that resolution is not arrived at, the parties will attempt to resolve the dispute by recourse to the services of a mediator agreed between them or nominated for the purpose at the request of any of them without prejudice to the Board's entitlement to terminate the Review. In the event that resolution has not been arrived at following mediation, either party shall be at liberty to terminate forthwith the Review.

Step 9.

On arrival, the fieldwork team should be supplied with a single case file index that lists all the cases that have been created within the diocese. These may be divided into two groups. The first group will contain all allegations that relate to living alleged or known perpetrators. The second will contain any that are deceased.

Step 10.

Depending on the volume involved a decision should be made as to whether all or a random sample of the "deceased group" should be reviewed. Care should be taken to include all prominent cases in the sample.

Step 11.

Each case file will be reviewed by each fieldworker independently in the first instance. They will create a written summary with chronological information of the case. In certain cases a second reader may be required, this will be discussed and agreed between the fieldworkers.

Step 12.

Following the reading of the case and the creation of a summary, the fieldworkers will analyse and assess the actions taken in the case. They will assess compliance with agreed Church policy that was extant at that time. They will also indicate whether any current risk exists in respect of the information contained within the file and advise the church Authority of necessary safeguarding action to reduce the risk.

Step 13.

When all the case files have been read, the fieldwork team will then examine and review any procedures or protocols that exist within the diocese to confirm that they are in compliance with the *Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance* document issued by the NBSCCCI in February of 2009.

Step 14.

To complete the Review, the fieldwork team will then seek to speak to those directly involved in the safeguarding structure in the diocese. This should include the Advisory Panel, a sample of parish safeguarding representatives, the designated person, the safeguarding committee, victim support and advisors and the Bishop/Provincial. The purpose of these interviews is to form a view of the competence and effectiveness of the safeguarding structure that exists within the Church Authority.

Step 15.

The fieldwork team will also seek to speak to representatives of the key statutory agencies to provide them with an opportunity to express their views on the quality of the working relationships that exist between them and the Church Authority.

Step 16.

A verbal feedback session on initial key findings will be given to the Church Authority.

Step 17.

Upon completion of the field work, the team may request to take materials – other than casework records to review off-site; this alongside all materials gathered by the reviewers, including written notes on cases and meetings, will be analysed and will form the basis of the draft assessment review report.

Step 18.

The draft will be forwarded to the Church Authority for factual accuracy checking.

Step 19.

Alongside all other reports under review, the report will be presented in draft to the Reference Group for their critique and comment. If further work is required at the direction of the Reference group the CEO will ensure this work is completed and advise the Church Authority accordingly.

Step 20.

The report will be legally proofed by NBSCCCI lawyer.

Step 21.

The report will be forwarded to the National Board for approval

Step 22

A final draft report will then be submitted to the Church Authority. The expectation would be that the Report will be published by the Church Authority at an agreed time in the future.

Step 23.

All case material written, including summaries, as part of the review, which are for the reviewers use only, will be stored on a secure server.

Guide for Reviewers

In terms of small (female religious orders) reference should be made to the following:

1. Has the Order provided alternative care to children in an orphanage, industrial school or children's residential home, but no longer is engaged in running such services;
2. Has the order provided education to children, in both or either boarding schools and day schools, but no longer does so ;
3. Has the order provided medical and/or nursing services to children, but no longer does so;
4. Has the order provided any other services to children, in community services centres, youth clubs etc., and no longer does so;
5. Does the order currently provide any sort of service to children and families that brings them into regular contact with children;
6. Has the order never provided any service to children (e.g. contemplative orders).

In relation to category 1 above;

1. The reviewers will establish whether any service they provided is included in the list of children's residential services produced by the Residential Institutions Redress Board (RIRB);
2. If this is the case, reference should be made to this.
3. If complaints have been referred to the Redress Board or Ryan Commission, this review cannot access these records and that will be stated in the report.
4. If the order has received complaints which have not been processed through Redress or Ryan these cases will be thoroughly examined as detailed above.

Review of Policy and Procedures

1. It is recognised that not all Orders will have any ministry with children and therefore their policies and procedures should reflect the work that they do with children.
2. If the Order only works through other organisations, example in Diocesan work or in schools, they are required to follow the policies of those organisations.
3. If there are gaps in the policy document an assessment should be made as to whether the ministry engaged in requires full compliance with all criteria attached to the seven standards
4. Where it is clear that the criteria do not apply a reference should be made at the beginning of the review report that the Order's ministry is not directly with children and therefore adherence to particular criteria do not apply.
5. In the Order is a contemplative Order, there is no expectation that they will have detailed policies and procedures, but reference should be made to their ministry and that they have no contact with children.
6. In all cases, contact will be made with the civil authorities to identify if they have any child safeguarding concerns in relation to the order.