



THE NATIONAL BOARD FOR
SAFEGUARDING CHILDREN
IN THE CATHOLIC CHURCH

Review of Child Safeguarding Practice
in the religious congregation of
The Comboni Missionaries of the Heart of Jesus

undertaken by

The National Board for Safeguarding Children in the
Catholic Church in Ireland (NBSCCCI)

December 2015

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
<i>Background</i>	3
<i>Introduction</i>	4
<i>Role Profile</i>	5
<i>Profile of Members</i>	5
<i>Policy and Procedures Document</i>	5
<i>Structures</i>	5
<i>Management of Allegations</i>	6
<i>Conclusion</i>	6
<i>Terms of Reference</i>	7

Background

The National Board for Safeguarding Children in the Catholic Church in Ireland (NBSCCCI) was asked by the Sponsoring Bodies, namely the Irish Episcopal Conference, the Conference of Religious of Ireland and the Irish Missionary Union, to undertake a comprehensive review of child safeguarding practice within and across all the Church Authorities on the island of Ireland.

The NBSCCCI is aware that some religious congregations have ministries that involve direct contact with children while others do not. In religious congregations that have direct involvement with children, reviews of child safeguarding have been undertaken by measuring their practice compliance against all seven Church standards. Where a religious congregation no longer has, or never had ministry involving children and has not received any allegation of sexual abuse, the NBSCCCI reviews are conducted using a shorter procedure. The size, age and activity profiles of religious congregations can vary significantly and the NBSCCCI accepts that it is rational that the form of review be tailored to the profile of each Church Authority, where the ministry with children is limited or non-existent. The procedure for assessment of safeguarding practice with such congregations is set out in the contents page of this report. The NBSCCCI welcomes that in order to have full openness, transparency and accountability, religious congregations that do not have ministry with children have made requests to have their safeguarding practice examined and commented upon.

The purpose of this review remains the same and it is to confirm that current child safeguarding practice complies with the standards set down within the guidance issued by the Sponsoring Bodies in February 2009, *Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance Document for the Catholic Church in Ireland* and that all known allegations and concerns had been appropriately dealt with. To achieve this task, safeguarding practice in each of these Church authorities is reviewed through an examination of policy and procedures, and through interviews with key personnel involved both within and external to the religious congregation.

This report contains the findings of the *Review of Child Safeguarding Practice in the religious congregation of the Comboni Missionaries of the Heart of Jesus* undertaken by the NBSCCCI in line with the request made to it by the Sponsoring Bodies. The review was conducted as a desktop review which took the form of a detailed telephone interview with the Provincial Superior who is based in England and a review of relevant information made available by the Provincial Superior to the reviewer.

The findings of the review have been shared with a reference group before being submitted to the Provincial Superior along with any recommendations arising from the findings.

Introduction

The Comboni Missionaries of the Heart of Jesus (also known as the Verona Fathers) are an international Roman Catholic Religious and Missionary Order of ordained priests and lay brothers founded by Bishop Daniel Comboni in Verona (Italy) in 1867 specifically to serve the missionary endeavours of the Roman Catholic Church in the South of the world.

Inspired by the Gospel, its Members live a common life together, and practice lifelong religious vows of poverty, chastity and obedience, all in furtherance of the Roman Catholic Religion. Everything is placed and held in common: Members do not own property of any kind or possess individual Accounts with banks or similar financial institutions. There are presently worldwide some one thousand seven hundred (1,700) Comboni Missionaries of forty (40) different nationalities working in some fifty (50) different countries throughout Europe, Africa, Asia and the Americas.

The aims of the Comboni Missionaries - in the United Kingdom, Ireland and Overseas - may be summarised as follows:

- To bear witness to the love of God for all, as experienced in Jesus Christ;
- To proclaim the Gospel of Christ to those who have not heard it;
- To foster - according to Gospel values - justice, peace and the integrity of creation worldwide;
- To promote awareness of the missionary work of the Roman Catholic Church in the United Kingdom and in the rest of Europe;
- To promote the missionary vocation;
- To serve and support young Churches, particularly in Africa, as they grow and mature;
- To collect and distribute funds for the relief of famine and dire poverty.

Governance

The Comboni Missionaries are governed at an international level by a Superior-General and four (4) General Councillors who reside at General Headquarters in Rome. The Superior-General and his Councillors are elected for a six-year term of office (renewable upon re-election for one further term only) at a 'General Chapter' which is held in Rome every six (6) years and which is composed of 'Provincial Superiors' and elected 'Delegates' from each of the thirty-one (31) semi-autonomous 'Provinces' or 'Circumscriptions' into which the Order is divided along geographical lines. All those who participate in the 'General Chapter' are perpetually professed Members of the Order who have freely chosen to dedicate their lives, their time, their energies and their talents to the Church's missionary work.

One of these 'Provinces' or 'Circumscriptions' is the 'London Province' which consists of the Communities resident and working in the United Kingdom and includes the two (2) men working and resident in Ireland. The 'Province' is governed by a 'Provincial Superior' and a four-member 'Provincial Council' - all of whom are elected for a three-year term of office which is renewable upon re-election, again for one further term only. The Provincial Superior is presently in the second year of his second term in post and will leave this office in December 2016. There are in total twenty three (23) men resident and working within the 'London Province' of whom there are two (2) Comboni Missionaries working and resident in Ireland. The average age of the members of the 'London Province' is sixty-eight years (68). The Provincial Superior and his Council meet regularly during the year to:

- direct the activities of Members in the 'London Province';

- assess and evaluate progress within the 'London Province' in the light of the decisions of the previous 'General Chapter';
- review finances and legal developments;
- mediate with the Superior-General and his Council;
- co-ordinate and implement directives of the General Council;
- plan policies/guidelines for the 'London Province' for the foreseeable future.

The Comboni Missionaries are a registered Charitable Trust in the UK and in Ireland. In fulfilment of the objectives of the Trust, it is the policy of the Charity to undertake a range of charitable activities in the United Kingdom and in Ireland to support Members of the Congregation living and working at home and overseas - in a special way those in Africa.

The Order is a member of the Irish Missionary Union (IMU).

Role Profile (past and present role with children):

The Comboni Missionaries first came to Ireland to establish a missionary office in the mid 1980's. The role then as it is now is to raise missionary awareness, fundraising/missions appeals and maintaining contact with benefactors and supporters. There is no history of ministry with children with members of the Order in this country and their present role does not include ministry with children.

Profile of Members:

The two members of the Comboni Missionaries resident and working in Ireland are aged fifty-four and seventy years respectively.

Policy and Procedures Document:

The 'London Province' of the Comboni Missionaries is aligned with the Arundel and Brighton Diocese in the UK in terms of its child safeguarding practice and structures and follows the Catholic Safeguarding Advisory Service (CSAS) Policy and Procedures guidance. In Ireland the NBSCCCI guidelines are followed and one of the two men based in Ireland have attended safeguarding training with the Dublin Diocese as well as with the NBSCCCI. In addition to this training they have availed of child safeguarding training provided in the Arundel and Brighton Diocese in the UK. The reviewer understands that the Irish residence of the Comboni Missionaries contains a folder containing child safeguarding documentation with the relevant NBSCCCI guidance.

The reviewer was informed that the topic of good child safeguarding practice is addressed at both Provincial Council and Assembly meetings held at regular intervals throughout the year. The Congregation's own safeguarding officer addresses the Provincial Assembly at least once yearly.

Structures:

Because of this Order's extremely small presence in Ireland there is no child safeguarding structure within the Order in existence in this country. This is an acceptable and inevitable consequence of a ministry of two men. In the UK as already stated, the Order is very closely aligned with the diocesan child safeguarding structure and falls under the remit and requirement of that structure. The CSAS policy and procedure document is followed in

general terms by all members of the 'London Province' and the two members based in Ireland follow the NBSCCCI document and guidelines. The Provincial Superior assumes the main role of overall coordinator of safeguarding within the Irish context.

Management of Allegations and liaison with the statutory authorities:

A single allegation alleged to have occurred in Ireland was made against a non-Irish Comboni Missionary priest by a complainant from another jurisdiction. The allegation was made to a diocesan child protection service in 2013 and was reported to the Order's Superior-General in Rome. The appropriate social services in Ireland and internationally were notified also by the diocesan service. The allegation referred to 'inappropriate behaviour' alleged to have occurred in the mid-1980's when the complainant was seventeen years old and visiting the community in Ireland where the member of the Comboni Missionaries was resident at the time. Upon receipt of the allegation in 2013 the member was immediately placed on administrative leave in his country of residence by his superiors, meaning that he had no public ministry pending on an outcome of an investigation into the allegation by the Vicar-General and was assigned to a therapeutic setting for a number of months for assessment. The matter was reported to the Council for the Doctrine of the Faith (CDF). He was assessed as posing no risk to children or young people and was considered fit to return to active ministry as a priest. His ministry does not however currently include active pastoral ministry with children or young people, he continues to receive counselling and the Congregation holds the view that a further risk assessment and evaluation by his superiors in Rome would determine if he assumes such ministry in the future. The complainant in the case was met with on a number of occasions and was kept fully informed by the Vicar General of the progress in the case. He did not wish to pursue the matter further.

No other allegations have been made against this member or any other member of the Comboni Missionaries in Ireland. The reviewer is aware that the above allegation was reported to the Tulsa Child and Family Agency auditors in 2013 as part of that agency's data compilation in respect of the Ferns Audit.

In the UK, where the Comboni Missionaries ran a Junior Seminary School until the mid-1980's in Yorkshire, there have been allegations of sexual abuse at that school alleged to have occurred in the 1960's and 1970's by four named priests two of whom are now deceased. A group of twelve complainants have unified to seek justice and to publicly express their complete dissatisfaction with how the Comboni Missionaries have addressed and managed the allegations over the years.

Conclusion:

The presence of this Missionary Order is extremely small in Ireland. The reviewer is satisfied as a result of a discussion with the Provincial Superior that child safeguarding is a live topic amongst the members of the Comboni Missionaries including the two members based in Ireland.

As the office in Ireland is, in many ways a satellite office, and in the absence of a child safeguarding structure, the reviewer recommends that the members based in Ireland along with the Provincial Superior continue with their engagement with both the National Board for Safeguarding Children in the Catholic Church in Ireland (NBSCCCI) and with the Dublin Archdiocesan Child Safeguarding Office in order to further enhance their safeguarding links and training.

It is recognised that there is no active ministry with children and contact with children and young people is reported to be non-existent.

The evidence is that there has been transparency in relation to the one allegation which was received by the Order within the last two years relating to a situation alleged to have occurred in the mid-1980's. The Order appears to have taken adequate steps to assess risk and reduce risk. The complainant was met with by the Orders' superiors, was offered pastoral support and was kept informed of progress of his complaint at all times. The allegation is deemed to have been managed adequately and in a timely manner.

Recommendation 1:

The Provincial Superior should sign up to the revised policy and standards for the Catholic Church in Ireland and renew the Memorandum of Understanding with the NBSCCCI in 2016.

Review of Safeguarding in the Catholic Church in Ireland

Terms of Reference (which should be read in conjunction with the accompanying Notes)

Small Religious Congregations

Introduction

In order for the National Board to be able to state that all Church Authorities on the island of Ireland have been evaluated in respect of their child safeguarding policies and practices, both historical and current, then some form of appropriate assessment has to be conducted of every one of these. It is rational however that the form of assessment is tailored to the profile of each Church Authority, and that needless expenditure of resources and unnecessary interference in the life of religious orders and communities that have no children-specific ministry would be avoided.

This Review seeks to examine the current arrangements for safeguarding children across small Religious Congregations /Orders, and Missionary Societies in Ireland who have limited or no direct contact with children as part of the Congregations ministry.

It would also scrutinize practice within all known cases to ensure that they have been responded to appropriately.

The review's methodology is an adaptation of the methodology developed for all Dioceses and large religious congregations and missionary societies, where the ministry involves regular contact with children.

The proposed Review would consider the following:-

- (a) Former role with children
- (b) Allegations of child abuse against members and how these have been responded to
- (c) Existing relationships with statutory authorities such as the HSE, Gardai in the Republic and the HSCT or PSNI in Northern Ireland.
- (d) Policies in place and being applied for safeguarding children
- (e) Roles and responsibilities and where they exist the operation of Advisory Panels, and Safeguarding Committees

The objective of the Review would be to confirm if there have been any allegations and how known allegations have been responded to; in addition the review seeks to confirm what the current arrangements for safeguarding children are. In particular, emphasis will be placed on establishing how policies and practice matches up to the standards set down in the Safeguarding Children Guidance published by the National Board for Safeguarding Children in the Catholic Church launched in February 2009. Priority, at all times, will be given to how policy and practice can be improved and strengthened. If policies and/or practices are identified that are concerning, inadequate, or dangerous, they will be addressed through the provision of guidance and support, and through the reporting of these situations to the appropriate statutory authorities, if this has not already happened. Similarly, those that are good examples will be highlighted with a view to them being adopted comprehensively across all parts of the Church. All cases that relate to alleged or known offenders that are alive will be read and included in the Review. In cases where the alleged or known offender

is deceased, these will be sampled in an attempt to gather learning from them that will be used to inform the framing of recommendations.

Guidance Documents

The Review will be guided by the following:-

- (a) Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance;
- (b) Children First Guidance in ROI; and Regional Child Protection Guidelines in Northern Ireland;
- (c) Legislation that exists in each jurisdiction which contributes to safeguarding children and young people.

The Review will be undertaken by the National Board for Safeguarding Children through their National Office and led by the Chief Executive Officer.

The Review process will be overseen by a **Reference Group** to whom the CEO will report on a regular basis. The membership of this **Reference Group** has been drawn from each of the statutory child protection agencies in both jurisdictions, along with eminent individuals in the field from academia. The current Reference Group consists of : Dr Helen Buckley (TCD); Mr Paul Harrison (Tusla), and John Toner (SBNI).

It is important to confirm that the value of the Review is dependent upon full and complete access to all relevant documentation and information relating to the abuse of children known to the individual Church authorities. The Review will proceed on the basis that willingness exists on the part of each of the subjects of the Review to provide full access to the fieldwork team, subject, where relevant, to the terms of the Data Processing Deed agreed between the Sponsoring Bodies and entered into between the parties hereto.

Step Guide to the Review Process

Step 1.

A letter of invitation to review is sent by the Provincial/Regional Superior or other person responsible for the Congregation/ Order or Missionary Society (hereinafter referred to as ‘the Ordinary’).

Step 2.

The CEO will forward a survey to the provincial which will identify:

- Current number of members
- Past role with children
- Current role with children
- Total number of allegations received up to 2014
- Number of living members against whom there are allegations

Step 3.

For any Order where there have been allegations a full review will proceed, as per step 4 - 23. For those Orders where there have been no known allegations a desk top examination of policies and procedures will take place followed by a site visit to interview all relevant personnel within the safeguarding structure. For these orders **step 5 and 13-23** will apply.

Step 4.

The CEO and Ordinary will confirm the dates for the fieldwork for the Review, and names of the fieldwork team.

Step 5.

The Church Authority will be asked to make available all of the case files and related documentation in respect of any safeguarding concerns that have been identified within the diocese. The Church Authority will make available a room with wireless internet access for the reviewers to conduct their review of files, so that any records made by the reviewers can be directly typed and stored onto a secure server which is only accessed by the reviewers. In the absence of internet access the reviewers will type their notes onto a secure encrypted usb stick for later uploading onto the secure server.

Step 6.

The Church Authority will be requested to sign the revised Data Processing Deed prior to the arrival of the team.

Step 7.

The Church Authority will arrange a schedule of interviews with all who hold safeguarding roles within its functional area. The designated person and the Church Authority will be available to the reviewers throughout the period of fieldwork.

Step 8.

The fieldwork team when they arrive on site will firstly confirm that they have a suitable place to work in and that all the required documentation has been provided to them for their Review. In the event that the fieldwork team forms the opinion that the Church Authority has not provided access to all such documents, the Board shall give notice in writing to the Church Authority of the opinion of the fieldwork team and such notice shall specify the reasons for same. Thereupon, the Church Authority shall respond in detail to the Notice. Each party shall use its best endeavours to resolve any differences of opinion which shall arise and, in the event that resolution is not arrived at, the parties will attempt to resolve the dispute by recourse to the services of a mediator agreed between them or nominated for the purpose at the request of any of them without prejudice to the Board's entitlement to terminate the Review. In the event that resolution has not been arrived at following mediation, either party shall be at liberty to terminate forthwith the Review.

Step 9.

On arrival, the fieldwork team should be supplied with a single case file index that lists all the cases that have been created within the diocese. These may be divided into two groups. The first group will contain all allegations that relate to living alleged or known perpetrators. The second will contain any that are deceased.

Step 10.

Depending on the volume involved a decision should be made as to whether all or a random sample of the "deceased group" should be reviewed. Care should be taken to include all prominent cases in the sample.

Step 11.

Each case file will be reviewed by each fieldworker independently in the first instance. They will create a written summary with chronological information of the case. In certain cases a second reader may be required, this will be discussed and agreed between the fieldworkers.

Step 12.

Following the reading of the case and the creation of a summary, the fieldworkers will analyse and assess the actions taken in the case. They will assess compliance with agreed Church policy that was extant at that time. They will also indicate whether any current risk exists in respect of the information contained within the file and advise the church Authority of necessary safeguarding action to reduce the risk.

Step 13.

When all the case files have been read, the fieldwork team will then examine and review any procedures or protocols that exist within the diocese to confirm that they are in compliance with the *Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance* document issued by the NBSCCCI in February of 2009.

Step 14.

To complete the Review, the fieldwork team will then seek to speak to those directly involved in the safeguarding structure in the diocese. This should include the Advisory Panel, a sample of parish safeguarding representatives, the designated person, the safeguarding committee, victim support and advisors and the Bishop/Provincial. The purpose of these interviews is to form a view of the competence and effectiveness of the safeguarding structure that exists within the Church Authority.

Step 15.

The fieldwork team will also seek to speak to representatives of the key statutory agencies to provide them with an opportunity to express their views on the quality of the working relationships that exist between them and the Church Authority.

Step 16.

A verbal feedback session on initial key findings will be given to the Church Authority.

Step 17.

Upon completion of the field work, the team may request to take materials – other than casework records to review off-site; this alongside all materials gathered by the reviewers, including written notes on cases and meetings, will be analysed and will form the basis of the draft assessment review report.

Step 18.

The draft will be forwarded to the Church Authority for factual accuracy checking.

Step 19.

Alongside all other reports under review, the report will be presented in draft to the Reference Group for their critique and comment. If further work is required at the direction of the Reference group the CEO will ensure this work is completed and advise the Church Authority accordingly.

Step 20.

The report will be legally proofed by NBSCCCI lawyer.

Step 21.

The report will be forwarded to the National Board for approval

Step 22

A final draft report will then be submitted to the Church Authority. The expectation would be that the Report will be published by the Church Authority at an agreed time in the future.

Step 23.

All case material written, including summaries, as part of the review, which are for the reviewers use only, will be stored on a secure server.

Guide for Reviewers

In terms of small (female religious orders) reference should be made to the following:

1. Has the Order provided alternative care to children in an orphanage, industrial school or children's residential home, but no longer is engaged in running such services;
2. Has the order provided education to children, in both or either boarding schools and day schools, but no longer does so ;
3. Has the order provided medical and/or nursing services to children, but no longer does so;
4. Has the order provided any other services to children, in community services centres, youth clubs etc., and no longer does so;
5. Does the order currently provide any sort of service to children and families that brings them into regular contact with children;
6. Has the order never provided any service to children (e.g. contemplative orders).

In relation to category 1 above;

1. The reviewers will establish whether any service they provided is included in the list of children's residential services produced by the Residential Institutions Redress Board (RIRB);
2. If this is the case, reference should be made to this.
3. If complaints have been referred to the Redress Board or Ryan Commission, this review cannot access these records and that will be stated in the report.
4. If the order has received complaints which have not been processed through Redress or Ryan these cases will be thoroughly examined as detailed above.

Review of Policy and Procedures

1. It is recognised that not all Orders will have any ministry with children and therefore their policies and procedures should reflect the work that they do with children.
2. If the Order only works through other organisations, example in Diocesan work or in schools, they are required to follow the policies of those organisations.
3. If there are gaps in the policy document an assessment should be made as to whether the ministry engaged in requires full compliance with all criteria attached to the seven standards
4. Where it is clear that the criteria do not apply a reference should be made at the beginning of the review report that the Order's ministry is not directly with children and therefore adherence to particular criteria do not apply.
5. In the Order is a contemplative Order, there is no expectation that they will have detailed policies and procedures, but reference should be made to their ministry and that they have no contact with children.
6. In all cases, contact will be made with the civil authorities to identify if they have any child safeguarding concerns in relation to the order.